

BOOKS REVIEWED IN THIS ISSUE

Situation Ethics.....	<i>Joseph Fletcher</i>
From Anathema to Dialogue.....	<i>Roger Garaudy</i>
Free To Live, Free To Die.....	<i>Malcolm Boyd</i>
What the Spirit Says to the Churches.....	<i>Hubert Richards</i>
The Truth Will Make You Free.....	<i>Rudolf Schnackenburg</i>
The Dynamism of Biblical Tradition.....	<i>Vol. 20, Concilium</i>
Man As Man and Believer.....	<i>Vol. 21, Concilium</i>
The Word in History.....	<i>T. Patrick Burke</i>
The Church After the Council.....	<i>Karl Rahner, S.J.</i>
Road to Renewal.....	<i>Bernard Haring, C.S.S.R.</i>
Teilhard de Chardin and the Mystery of Christ	<i>Christopher Mooney, S.J.</i>
Signs and Wonders.....	<i>Louis Monden, S.J.</i>
Mouchette.....	<i>Georges Bernanos</i>
The New Priests.....	<i>Michel de Saint Pierre</i>
St. Martin de Porres.....	<i>Sister Mary Alphonsus, O.S.S.R.</i>
The Nature of Mysticism.....	<i>David Knowles</i>
The New Theologians.....	<i>Ved Mehta</i>
Chastity and the Affective Life.....	<i>Albert Ple, O.P.</i>
Law and Political Theory.....	<i>Thomas Gilby, O.P.</i>
The Heart of Thomas More.....	<i>E. E. Reynolds</i>
Preaching As a Saving Encounter.....	<i>Michael Schmaus</i>
The Sunday Homily.....	<i>John Burke, O.P.</i>

BOOK REVIEWS

SITUATION ETHICS: The New Morality. By Joseph Fletcher. Philadelphia, The Westminster Press, 1966. pp. 176. Paper.

If a man wanted to show that there was no such thing as a common human nature he might write a book describing every human aberration he could find: six-fingered men, alligator-skin men, men who looked and acted like fish. After consulting the pages of a psychiatric manual he would strengthen his case by describing the various human phenomena such as manic depressives, schizophrenics, and the like. Secondly, if he wanted to show there are no fast rules for preserving the health of men he would run through all the exceptions he could find: that Africans, let us say, have a very low tolerance for milk, that Arabs cannot stand corn, or Eskimos oranges. Thirdly, if he wanted to shock established philosophers of human nature, or health experts, out of what he thought was their complacent certitude about matters that were not all that certain, he would write a breezy book upsetting every professional applecart in sight.

And if an ordinary reader read such a book he might just forget that there is something common in all men, common and magnificent and eternal. He might just forget that Ovid and Shakespeare and Eliot display a common human characteristic to interpret life through creative poetry. He might also forget that while rules about milk, corn and oranges are one thing, rules about food, fresh air, exercise, sleep, are quite another; and that if an Arab cannot live with corn he nevertheless cannot live without food, air, water and sleep; and that what is true for the Arab is also true for the Eskimo, African and American alike. Finally, if the reader were a student of human nature or a health official he would not be shocked by the book. He would be exasperated.

Fletcher wants to show that except for love, there is no such thing as a common human morality, that it all depends on the situation. Page after page of extremely unusual cases stream through the book: the father demanding an abortion for his schizophrenic daughter who was raped by a sex maniac; the man trapped in the burning fuselage of a plane who begs to be shot; the mother in a Siberian labor camp whose only way to be joined to her husband and family is by getting pregnant by one of the guards; the mother in a Kentucky pioneer group surrounded by marauding Indians whose baby can be silenced only by strangulation. And on and on and on.

Now I don't think that there is any moralist in the world who would not at least be sympathetic to whatever course of action people in such situations would take. The circumstances are so straitened that the choice would fall back to an intuitive leap in the dark and a prayer to the living God to understand. What is wrong about Fletcher's analysis is that he uses these cases to conclude to things like: "Is adultery wrong? . . . I don't know. Maybe. Give me a case." (p. 142).

Or like: "Whether any form of sex (hetero, homo, or auto) is good or evil depends on whether love is truly served" (p. 139). In other words he takes the exception not to prove the rule but to prove there is no rule. His *new* morality could better be called a *no* morality.

Perhaps this is too sharp a criticism since Fletcher does affirm love as the one moral absolute. He says there are at bottom only three approaches to moral decisions: the legalist, the antinomian and the situational. The first sees in the law not just maxims to illustrate a situation but directives to be followed, and this is what Judaism, Catholicism and Protestantism have been following for centuries. The antinomians do away with all law and leave the moral decision to spontaneous choice arising, in the Christian, from the power of the Spirit, or, in the atheist, from the power of the man himself since the radical absurdity and discontinuity of reality give him no norms for action. Rejecting these two approaches, Fletcher opts for situationism, which accepts the ethical maxims of one's community as illuminators but not directors of choice. If in the situation love seems better served by setting these maxims aside, then let love be served.

The mistake here is with his application of legalism and implicitly with the concept of love. Fletcher does not limit legalism to civil or ecclesiastical laws which are followed blindly simply because they are laws; he applies it to all law. He makes no distinction between the dietary laws of the Old Testament and the moral precepts of the decalogue. To him eating kosher food has the same weight as avoiding adultery. If love can tell a man not to eat kosher, as it told St. Paul on occasion, it can also tell him at times to commit adultery. Time and time again throughout the book Fletcher begins an argument against law by citing ecclesiastical canons of the Old or New Testament which any person in a given situation might lovingly set aside, and he concludes that the same attitude should be maintained for all law. In Chapter 4, for example, entitled "Love is the Only Norm" he begins by citing the non-legalistic attitude of Christ to the Sabbath laws. He goes on to approve in us the same attitude for the decalogue. And he summarizes all he has said in another example, David and his men eating the propitiatory loaves. The decalogue (forgive the pun) gets sandwiched between two ceremonial laws.

His concept of love is implicitly wrong, too. He cites scriptural and philosophical definitions which would be acceptable to most. The trouble is not what he says love is but how he uses it to solve his various cases. The couple whose parents object to their marriage call on love to have intercourse, cause a pregnancy and force the parents to concede to their desires. The father of the mongoloid child calls on love to kill the child. President Truman calls on love to drop the atom bomb on Nagasaki and Hiroshima. The love here may be sincere enough, but it does not resemble, or resembles only remotely, the agape preached by Christ in which total self-giving to God is involved, as well as deep reverence for His commandments.

Christians have always recognized that the circumstances of an act affects its morality, that stealing, for example, in the case of a starving man is not wrong. In recent years, due to a development in the understanding of the dignity of the person as well as to the many new investigations of the natural law, situationism, even within Christianity, has had a somewhat broader application. But Fletcher

has applied it right across the board. He has used the widest brush possible to paint out a hundred other colors. His "love" paints out justice, fortitude and temperance.

The book is troubling because it refuses to regard morality as a difficult subject. It puts it in a teacup, one might even say, a loving cup. But morality is too complicated and too subtle for that. In a word, Fletcher has oversimplified. Human nature may not be the absolute we thought it was; but it is still recognizable in men as different as Caesar and Churchill. Some health rules may be reunderstood and changed frequently and some may apply to this group but not to that; but others apply to all men, everywhere, at all times.

This is not to say that I view the "old" morality of legalism in a favorable light. It is rather to say that Fletcher's book on the "new" morality does not help the discussion much. If he gets after us for being too absolutist in our application of the law (and we have been), we get after him for summing up life as freakish because he has seen it as reflected in strange and warped mirrors. Is adultery wrong? When you answer that by saying, "I don't know" you have implicitly admitted that marriage is not a stable union. Can a father kill his child? If you answer, "Maybe not. Give me a case" you have admitted that life itself is not a *datum* from God. But marriage is a stable and a sacramental union; life does come from God. We do not have the right to tamper with either.

I am certain that I do not have all the answers to the moral problems in our world. But for Fletcher to propose his answers (which I do not accept) with such assurance, such certitude—that, as I have said, is exasperating.

Thomas R. Heath, O.P.

FROM ANATHEMA TO DIALOGUE. By Roger Garaudy. With introduction by Leslie Dewart. New York, Herder & Herder, 1966. pp. 124. \$3.95.

Is it possible to dialogue with a communist with any hope of some common meeting ground? This metaphysical question is pointless. For Roger Garaudy, a French marxist theoretician, has already begun the dialogue. And not only has he assembled marxist observations in the dialogue, but he shows his familiarity with contemporary Christian sources as well. Answering the questions of contemporary theologians of the Christian faith, Mons. Garaudy has already established a dialogue on more than a practical level.

The argument proceeds in this way: from the necessity of a dialogue, the author moves to the Christian recognition in our day of what is *basic* to our belief, abstracted from its culturally determined forms of the past. The response is then offered from the marxist observations of what is basic to their belief, again precized from the culturally conditioned aspects of their thought about religion. The consequence is eye-opening. It has far-reaching significance. For the two, seemingly diametric poles agree at least on one point in substance—the dignity of man and his responsibility to build the earth.

Naturally, there is also a basic disagreement which must be recognized. After assembling the points made by Christian thinkers such as Rahner, DuBarle,

Teilhard and Jose Gonzalez-Ruiz and the recent developments in marxist and communist thought, the author strikingly emphasizes and delimits the area of disagreement. As he sees it, Christianity believes that the future of man is already present in a transcendent way in the present historical moment. While the marxist begins at the same place, the desire for human happiness, and recognizes the transcendent element of history, he can only strive to realize this element in the future. History *has* a meaning. Life *has* a meaning. For the marxist, the meaning is derived from the future. For the Christian, the meaning is derived from the future, it is true, but this future is seen as already somewhat realized in the present. And this realization cannot be accepted by the communist. The fact that I am thirsty, does not prove the existence of the spring! The fact that man craves the freedom to reflect about the values of his life and of human existence in some state of peace and happiness, does not mean that such a state already exists. The fact that man strives after the transcendence of history does not prove that that transcendence exists in the now. (This is where the Christian profoundly disagrees.) Garaudy then observes that communism is a progressive activity of creativity of the future, while Christianity, although containing this element indeed, is also dogmatic. It is dogmatic in its insistence that the freedom of this creativity comes from a transcendent God actively present in the world.

The question of a dialogue in this country seems slim. In the U.S., the Communist Party at present does not represent a vital contribution to the American political scene, nor does it seem to contribute anything to the development of human freedom. For this reason, we know little of the present development of marxist thought. Garaudy instills in one the sense of the seriousness of their re-examination, not only of their basic tenets, but also of their many mistakes. He clearly shows that religion was considered, even by Marx, as a valuable contribution to human creativity. The famous phrase: "Religion is the opium of the people," not only does not represent Marx's more profound thinking on this subject but also is an historically conditioned diatribe, the conditions for which no longer exist. On the Christian side of the conference table is the recognition of a long-standing tradition in the Church of identifying with the poor and needy, the oppressed, the "revolutionaries." The other tradition, which Garaudy calls "Constantinian," identifies with the ruling class and the status quo. He insists that the Christian, particularly in view of the writings of John XXIII, Paul VI, and the decrees of Vatican II, must again be responsive to the call of the non-Constantinian tradition.

Without question there are dangers in a dialogue. But both Garaudy and Dewart, who furnishes an excellent introduction on the nature and conditions of the dialogue, agree that no dialogue can truly take place unless the members expect the other side to be deeply committed to their respective faiths. Dewart serves us well when he indicates the condition *sine qua non* for such a dialogue: we must firmly hold what is basic and true about our faith, and yet we must be willing to change what is historically conditioned. How is this possible? His answer is, simply, the development of dogma. Both marxists and Christians must first formulate viable theories, explanations to themselves, of how their dogmas and beliefs can develop, before they can engage in any serious dialogue. When one reads the introduction, he immediately becomes aware of the reasons for

writing *The Future of Belief* uppermost in Dewart's mind. The issue is plain. Can Christian dogmas change? And if so, how? Garaudy will have to develop a similar theory for the marxists.

Of course, the thinkers represented in this volume are controversial. There is no guarantee that Garaudy speaks for the communist party, or that Teilhard and a few French Dominicans are speaking for the Catholic Church. And yet what they have to say seriously challenges the reader to consider his task, in common with all men; as Teilhard himself has observed, "the age of nations is past; our task is now to build the earth."

David Thomasma, O.P.

FREE TO LIVE, FREE TO DIE. By Malcolm Boyd. New York, Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1967. pp. 114. \$3.95.

This is a collection of ninety short meditations on such assorted topics as death, life, nuns in Selma, sex before dinner, civil rights' murders, Easter, phoniness, Camus and the Negro, John Kennedy, paternalism, community, and the death of God. The meditations are rather pointlessly arranged under the headings "morning," "noon," and "evening"; but the style is familiar, similar to Boyd's earlier book *Are You Running With Me, Jesus?*

Boyd's stated purpose is to show that we are always meditating; we are always thinking about our situation. This book is an example of such meditations. I think that Boyd teaches us a good lesson. Many of us tend to flee from any organized "religious" meditation; we think that meditation is too difficult. Boyd proves that meditation is quite easy; perhaps it is the most natural thing in our lives. We must learn to begin with our own personal experience and then look for the deeper meanings in these commonplace events.

It is obvious that Boyd intends more than merely to encourage us to meditate. He is concerned with freedom. Man should be free to live and free to die. As a matter of fact, almost no one is authentically free today. There may be many who consider themselves really free men, but they are just as phony as their phony neighbors. The prophet is free; he startles us with his freely expressed convictions; when he ceases to startle, he may have lost his freedom.

I suspect that Boyd is not absolutely certain what it means to be free. He is certain that the Negro is not free today, and he will do everything he can to help the Negro acquire his freedom. But there is a hint that freedom does not mean merely the bold honesty of the prophet. Boyd meditates on the old lady who has a new experience of "freedom" in her situation of helplessness, limitation and need. We must be open to the possibility that authentic freedom is not the same as total independence.

Boyd reacts against the indiscriminate use of the word "love." He suggests (rightly, I think) that we do not really know what love is. Perhaps the time has come to avoid using the word for a while. That would help to teach us that many things are not "love."

Free to Live, Free to Die does for meditation what *Are You Running With Me, Jesus?* did for prayer. If you must learn again that it is easy to meditate, this is a good book for you.

Jordan Finan, O.P.

WHAT THE SPIRIT SAYS TO THE CHURCHES. By Hubert Richards. New York, P. J. Kenedy & Sons, 1967. pp. 141. \$4.50.

A desperate Christian need in our times is fervent hope. The Book of Revelation, written precisely to instill such a hope in the hearts of Christians, should be a primary scriptural source to fulfill this need. And yet it is not. Why?

The reason this book of scripture is less widely read and pondered than others is its difficult literary form: apocalyptic. Our minds have difficulty translating lambs, thrones, dragons, beasts, mystic numbers, etc. into contemporary concepts. Hubert Richards approaches this problem directly. He says that the reader may feel "that the Apocalypse is a book which either finds a man cracked or leaves him so, in other words that a person must be mad to try and find out what it is all about; if he is not, he will be mad when he has finished." (p. 9) But he is not content to cite our "modern problem." Rather, he has written a marvelous book to help us understand the message of the Book of Revelation.

The author is one of the collaborators in the translation into English of *The Jerusalem Bible*. He has succeeded in writing an understandable commentary on the Apocalypse where others have failed because of his realism and familiarity with apocalyptic literary form. His realism, for example, helps explain the references to the white cards, the lukewarm being vomited out of one's mouth, and a new wreath which are found in the promises to the Seven Churches. The "white cards" are a reference to cards or tickets given to pagan games in one city; near Leodicia are found sulfur baths, some of which were only lukewarm and produced a nauseous odor; a "new" wreath is a reference to a wreath on a hill near one of the cities dedicated to a pagan cause.

This Book of Revelation is meant to be a comfort to those under trial, who are unable to see the process of God's saving activity in the events of their immediate history. The message of the book is that there is an activity of God in these events, and that his final activity, the total victory of Christ, is just around the corner. In other words, the Book says to us: "Hang on!" There are seven distinct attempts (revelations) to get this message across, each one complete and whole in itself. The beasts, dragons, kings, and whatall are references to Roman emperors and the devil which the early Christians would have readily understood. And Fr. Richards makes these understandable to us, too.

The book was written to counteract two evils facing the Churches of the days of emperor worship and gnosticism. For this reason, the transcendence of God and his majesty are stressed as well as the absolute victory and divinity of Christ. And the Johannine theme of realized eschatology—the victory of Christ is already here!—makes this book relevant to our own situation and to the Church through all ages.

Fr. Richard's key to the Apocalypse of John is not only a popularly presented and readable book, it is also highly informed and is accompanied with a wealth of cross-references in the footnotes. When read with the commentary contained in the Jerusalem Bible on the Book of Revelation, it serves as an excellent guide and in many cases, provides another point of view. This volume can do nothing but enrich our appreciation of this wonderful scriptural source of hope.

David Thomasma, O.P.

THE TRUTH WILL MAKE YOU FREE. By Rudolf Schnackenburg. New York, Herder and Herder, 1966. pp. 126. \$3.95.

The Truth Will Make You Free is another excellent book by the noted New Testament scholar, Rudolf Schnackenburg. He delineates the truth of revelation from philosophic, historical and political truth and skillfully examines current exegetical themes which will help the student of Scripture arrive at a better understanding of "truth."

The book is composed of four sections. The first compares the truth of revelation with the truth of natural science and history and points out the religious purpose and scientific character of revelation. The second section discusses revelation as circumscribed by human knowledge and human language, and as bound to human history. The third section examines the eschatological and existential character of revelation. Finally, the fourth section, which is included for "persons especially interested in exegesis and theology," presents some problems for theology in the revelation of history, of faith, and in the written and oral tradition.

The Truth Will Make You Free is a small book, only 126 pages, but it is crammed full with current biblical trends which should be familiar to every student of salvation history. This book is a key to recent scholarship which will help the student to understand the Bible, and, thereby, bring him to a deeper knowledge of Christ, who is the "Truth" that will make you free.

Frederick Langton, O.P.

THE DYNAMISM OF BIBLICAL TRADITION. Volume 20 of CONCILIUM. New York, Paulist Press, 1967. pp. 213. \$4.50.

Pierre Grelot establishes the central theme of this new volume of *Concilium* in his opening article. Studies in tradition are usually concerned with the ecclesiastical tradition which derived from the revelation received by the apostles. However, the Scriptures themselves are the result of a living tradition. This tradition began with the beginnings of Israel and continued until the witness of the apostles brought an end to further revelation.

Joseph Schreiner investigates the development of the Israelite Credo. It never included the whole content of their faith and, as it developed, it remained always open to the inclusion of new, divine, saving deeds. From the first it confesses God as manifested in his saving works; later it includes the notions of creator and judge. The Son of David tradition grew up independently of Israel's ancient Credo but became fused with it at the time of the exile. Joseph Fitzmyer's study of Mt 22: 41-46 illustrates the development of this theme even in extra-biblical literature. It evolved beyond the limits of the Old Testament and was given a strong impetus in Jesus' debate with the Pharisees over the Davidic origin of the Messiah.

The later works of the Old Testament manifest a development in the faith of the community which is based on earlier works. Joseph Blenkinsopp shows how

Deutero-Isaiah re-presents the Exodus tradition, relating it both to God's creative activity and to his kingly role. In developing the Exodus tradition the prophet builds up a theological structure which is both historical and eschatological. Proverbs 1-9 is also the culmination of a lengthy development. Raymond Tourney's study of this passage shows its dependency on Deuteronomy and Jeremia and explains how it transposes the ancient Scriptures into a new perspective.

The New Testament likewise developed within the traditions of a community. Central to this development are the sayings of Jesus and the primitive kerygma. The various collections of sayings which appear in the Synoptics were a part of the living tradition of the early Christian community. Frans Neiryck takes Mk 9: 33-50 and develops a theory about these sayings based on key word association; this offers one explanation on how they came to be grouped as they are in the Gospels. Since this community was engaged in preaching the good news of salvation, there developed in it a well-defined kerygma which David Stanley sees as the key to the unity of the entire New Testament.

Paul was called separately to preach the Gospel of Christ, but he too was part of the living tradition, a tradition received from Christ himself and from the apostles. Jules Cambier sees in St. Paul both the perduring aspect of tradition and its dynamic aspect.

The volume concludes with an article by M. C. Vanhengel and J. Peters, "This Same Jesus," which is concerned with the present unrest regarding the historicity of the Gospels. The article deals with the methodology of contemporary exegesis in approaching this problem and investigates the basic connection between the act of faith in Christ and the reliability of our information about Jesus of Nazareth.

There is included in this work a series of six bibliographical surveys on the Homily. These surveys discuss the nature of the Homily as presently conceived and the literature now available in each of the six languages treated.

The importance of this volume cannot be underestimated. Each article by itself provides valuable insights into the development of the Scriptures, but together they point out the fact that what is contained in Scripture is a living reality. That reality lives today in the living tradition of the Church. The Church today must face the same challenge faced by Paul and the author of Proverbs, i.e., to re-present to the modern world what has been handed over to it.

Stephen Keegan, O.P.

MAN AS MAN AND BELIEVER. Volume 21 of CONCILIUM. New York, Paulist Press, 1967. pp. 178. \$4.50.

This volume of "theology in the age of renewal" is one sign that the Church is in the process of confronting the real crux of the Modernist crisis. When Modernism was making its attack upon the very heart of Christianity around the turn of the century, the magisterium exposed the erroneous excesses, but it lacked the theological tools to give a positive response to the difficulties involved. Vati-

can II reflects the progress that has taken place during the intervening time, but there is need for much more development in this post-conciliar age. Philosophical problems in the fields of anthropology and epistemology must be solved and added to the advances in scriptural and historical studies in order to answer such questions as: what is the relation between man as man and man as believer? how do we give adequate consideration to the entire context of human history and still attribute a unique moment in history to Christ? what is the dynamic connection between revelation, faith, dogma and the magisterium?

As is characteristic of the *Concilium* series, the first and more extensive part is devoted to several articles on various aspects of the theme of the volume, and the other two parts provide a bibliographical survey and documentation on related topics. In the opening article, Peter van Leeuwen, O.F.M., traces the genesis of the *Dogmatic Constitution on Divine Revelation* from the original plan of the preparatory theological commission in 1960 through the schemas of 1962-63 to the final text of 1964 that was the basis of the Constitution. He shows how significant were the changes made during this laborious process: they led to a concept of revelation and a principle of its transmission that makes the fruitful posing of certain ecumenical questions possible. These questions have as their subject-matter the dominion of God's Word over the Church, the distinction between tradition, traditions and the magisterium, and particularly the pope's pastoral function within the context of the episcopal college and the entire community of the faithful.

In the second article, "What Is Man's Place in Divine Revelation?" Leo Bakker, S. J., explains that the Constitution has helped overcome the dilemma of revelation as a speaking by God completely from outside man and without any contribution from him. In fact, revelation expresses and enlightens man's understanding of himself. We can now begin to appreciate the genuinely human aspect of divine revelation and of our faith. Christianity, always living by the Incarnation, does not mean *either* God *or* man, but *both* God *and* man in an unbreakable bond of grace. At the same time, we must avoid the extreme theories of the Modernists like Tyrrel and Loisy who completely divorced the experience of faith from its dogmatic formulation and denied the divine uniqueness of Jesus Christ in our history. Juan Alfaro, S. J., in his article; "The Dual Aspect of Faith: Entrusting Oneself to God and Accepting the Christian Message", develops a theology that seems to balance both the divine and human elements of belief. God calls man from within by grace, and from without by the message of salvation. Man responds freely in a true choice of faith by either accepting or rejecting God.

Consequent upon these concepts of revelation and faith is the constant challenge to the Church that her preaching and teaching make the unique revelation of Christ relevant at all times. This appears especially true for our times when the process of secularization is separating religion more and more from the structures of this world. Persons today, therefore, are in need of a particular help to find God's revealing presence in their lives. The remaining articles are concerned with this crucial problem. Anton Vogtle outlines the conditions and requirements for a scriptural exegesis of the New Testament that would lead toward a more relevant preaching of the Gospel. Since the same relevance is re-

quired to preach dogmas, Gregory Baum proposes that the universal magisterium, for the sake of exercising its supreme function, should always be in dialogue with the whole Church and cites *Ecclesiam suam* as an excellent example. Hans Urs von Balthasar brings out the special character of a truth of faith in summoning man toward a total commitment in life. Finally, the concept of theology as an ecclesial science which must be of continuous service to a community of faith is excellently explained by M. D. Chenu, O.P.

Since the whole question of doctrinal development is intimately connected with the theme of this volume, the bibliographical survey provides accounts of recent Catholic and Protestant views. Walter Kasper gives an historical approach to the problem of the relationship between Gospel and Dogma. The volume concludes with a brief report on the international theological Congress held in Rome in October 1966.

Man as Man and Believer presents some important thought on very fundamental issues. It is hoped that this volume of *Concilium*, along with others in the series, will soon be made available at more popular prices for the many priests, religious and educated laity who want to learn what is going on in theology today.

Frederick M. Jelly, O.P.

THE WORD IN HISTORY. The Saint Xavier Symposium. Ed. by T. Patrick Burke. New York, Sheed and Ward, 1966. pp. 180. \$4.50.

The Second Ecumenical Council of the Vatican ended, for many, in a great flush of optimism. A new era for the Church seemed right around the corner. A fresh, clean breeze had entered the Church and was quickly sweeping away the old cobwebs.

There is a sense, of course, in which this feeling of optimism was justified. The Church was given a viable plan of renewal and reform, and in that sense a new day *had* dawned. But by now most have come to see that the process of renewal will be a long and somewhat painful one. The expectation that the Church would change overnight now appears naive.

The Saint Xavier Symposium, entitled *The Word In History*, is a good antidote for anyone still suffering from excessive optimism. The contributors to the Symposium—some of the finest theologians alive today—make it very clear that the Council marked only a *beginning* in the renewal-process. The papers, structured around the question "What are the principal theological problems facing the Church at the present time?", make it luminously clear that there *are* problems in theology today, and that these problems are far from settled.

In the opening essay, Karl Rahner explores the possibility and the necessity of developing an anthropological approach to theology. He shows how theology up to the present has suffered from the lack of such an anthropological orientation. Rahner's essay is followed by an essay by Fr. DeLubac, "Nature and Grace." The relationship of the natural and the supernatural is a problem which DeLubac has struggled with for years. (One need only think of his famous and hotly controverted *Surnaturel* published in 1946.) An article by the Flemish Dominican,

Edward Schillebeeckx, entitled "Faith Functioning in Human Self-Understanding" follows. Schillebeeckx here tries to come to terms with some of the unsettled questions left over from the modernist era.

Two Protestant theologians and one Orthodox are also presented. Dr. Joseph Sittler of the University of Chicago has a fine essay on "The Principal Problem for Protestant Theology Today." "The Problem" turns out to be a series of problems, most of them reducible to the doctrine of grace as elaborated by the Reformers. Dr. George Lindbeck's article is called "The Framework of Catholic-Protestant Disagreement." In it he does an excellent job of delineating areas of significant theological difference—a reality which is sometimes forgotten today. Alexander Schmemmann contributes a disturbing article called "Freedom In the Church," which interjects a strongly eschatological outlook into the collection.

"Institutionalized Religion" is the title of the contribution of Fr. Yves Congar. The article is especially helpful in clarifying issues at a time when ideology has changed so drastically and institutional structures have not. Other contributors are Charles Davis on "Understanding the Real Presence," J. B. Metz on "The Church and the World" and Jean Danielou on "Christianity and Non-Christian Religions."

All in all, *The Word In History* is a splendid volume. The reader will recognize that theological enquiry today is a serious and complex business. But he will take heart, too, that the inquiry is proceeding with a new vigor and a new enthusiasm which could only have come from the Second Vatican Council.

Bartholomew Carey, O.P.

THE CHURCH AFTER THE COUNCIL. By Karl Rahner, S.J.
New York, Herder & Herder, 1966. pp. 106. \$3.50.

The council was only a beginning: This is the conclusion one must reach in reading the three essays contained in this valuable book. And few theologians are better equipped than Karl Rahner to convey to us what this beginning promises for the future.

In the first essay, "The Council, A New Beginning," Rahner contends that this council was the most radical, ecumenical, and all-encompassing council ever to have taken place. It was the most radical in that it reworked its self-image from the ground up; the most ecumenical because it embraced all nationalities and invited all religious leaders to its deliberations; the most all-encompassing because the Church renewed every aspect of itself, from its internal constitution to its external relationship to the world. The German Jesuit feels that the collegial principles and the liturgical and missionary spirit of the Council were its finest and most challenging points. Because the Church has recognized that it is a pilgrim Church, the challenge of a new age must be responsibly met by its members. And this will take courage.

The second and third essays are less exhortatory and more reflective, but they clearly uncover the challenges mentioned in the first essay. In "The Church: A New Image," Rahner speculates what the Church of the future might be, and stresses three major features brought out by the Council deliberations and docu-

ments. The first of these features is the presence of the Church in the local community. This perspective has been developed by Rahner in other works, where he proposes that the Church will be dispersed into small, isolated communities in which, however, the members are totally committed. Perhaps this view is a trifle idealistic, e.g., that no social pressures would be exerted on some to become Christians. But present day events, among which is the de-Catholization of traditionally Christian lands, seem to bear out his insight.

The Church as the sacrament of the world's salvation is the second theme. This is an important section in which Rahner enlarges the boundaries of the Church to those who belong, not *corpore*, but *in corde*. He calls these latter "anonymous Christians." In this view, the sacramental Church will function as the effective promise of grace to men who have already been redeemed. In this it is the historical permanence of Christ's existence. A similar expression of the Church is Schillebeeckx's "visible extension of the glorified body of Christ in history."

Finally, Rahner develops the impetus given by the *Constitution on the Church*, in which the Church is seen primarily as a unity of love and only secondarily as a hierarchy. Against the insignificance of an individual in a gigantic social apparatus, Rahner stresses the dignity of the individual in a fraternity of men and women in Christ, devoted to the service of all men. The Church has been too long conceived as an authoritative body, or worse, a lonely heart's club! Rather it is primarily a sinful Church of sinners, poor and oppressed, containing charismatics. In short, it is something which we all are.

The third essay deals with "Theology: A New Challenge." In fostering theological science, the Church must recognize what happened at the council. First of all, neo-scholastic theology was superseded. A radical upheaval occurred which still has not made itself felt. The radicalness lies in a basic reformulation of the Church's understanding of herself and her mission. Among the implications of this revolution are: a reawakening of live truths from the ancient past which will demand greater historical theological research, a freedom of theological investigation and a plurality of theologies, a necessary dialogue with the world. The most profound awareness however is that theology can no longer be thought of as evolving only on the periphery. It is essentially historical. Rahner is not alone in this recognition; it is a common one among contemporary theologians (e.g., *Word In History* [New York: Sheed and Ward, 1967]—the results of the St. Xavier symposium of top-notch theologians). Following this point, Rahner offers valuable and lengthy accounts of areas of theological renewal and research. These pages will serve the professional theologian with enough matter for research for a lifetime!

David Thomasma, O.P.

ROAD TO RENEWAL. By Bernard Haring, C.S.S.R. Staten Island, Alba House, 1966. pp. 321. \$3.95.

This short study gives us Fr. Haring's reflections on the Council, particularly the third Session, from the viewpoint of both theological themes and human

pressures. Most of the major themes—word, church, sacrament, liturgy, holiness—are discussed, but the book is no formal commentary on the Council. It would seem to be more on the lines of an explanation for the “folks back home” of what went on and when. In eighteen brief chapters we have anecdotes and historical perspectives integrated with summations of the documents.

The book has more value than this description might suggest. Haring is able to explain simply and directly why particular themes came to the fore and how they can be traced consecutively through the documents. This procedure exposes their real import for the ordinary lay Catholic, and this is considerably harder to carry through than some suspect. Anyone charged with conveying the message of Vatican II to the theologically uninitiated is by now painfully aware that the Council documents alone will not suffice. Many homilists and catechists have discovered that the biblical-personalist tone of the documents require a frame of mind which the middle-aged Catholic simply does not have. To accomplish the pastoral goal of the Council, one must somehow select themes and then reduce them to ordinary language. It is here that Fr. Haring's essays will provide a key for the systematic presentation of Vatican II at the lectern, in the classroom and in the study group.

Barnabas Davis, O.P.

TEILHARD DE CHARDIN AND THE MYSTERY OF CHRIST.

By Christopher F. Mooney, S.J. New York, Harper & Row, 1966.
pp. 288. \$6.00.

Fr. Christopher Mooney's book provides us with a synthesis of the theological thought of Pierre Teilhard de Chardin. Teilhard himself outlined such a synthesis several times in his lifetime but never actually carried it through. Fr. Mooney chooses to let his fellow Jesuit speak for himself as much as possible, and as a result, the book includes many, many rewarding passages from Teilhard's own pen.

Fr. Mooney begins by setting forth the problem that Teilhard had come up against and was attempting to resolve. The problem is that which we have since come to call the problem of the Church and the modern world. What Teilhard was seeking was a way of uniting his orientation toward the world with his relationship to God and of remedying the scandal of a Christian outlook that was for the most part disengaged from the world.

This striving for unity sprang not only from Teilhard's intense Christian faith, but also from an intense experience of anxiety due to his realization of the mystery and seeming futility of human endeavor. Though caused initially by the shock of the First World War, this anxiety persisted throughout his whole life. How was man to persevere in his effort to build up the world, how was the “magnificent elan” of humanity to be kept up, in the face of the world's power to oppress and discourage?

In order to understand Teilhard's theological concerns one must first become familiar with his thought on the philosophical and scientific levels. Teilhard begins his system with a phenomenological analysis of the evolutionary process up to the point of the emergence of man. What disturbed Teilhard on this level

was a seeming failure to integrate man into the over-all cosmic view of reality. Man was the summit, the apex of nature and evolution, and yet precisely as a thinking being he was seen as disconnected from nature. As a means of restoring coherence to reality Teilhard argued that there were good grounds for ascribing a psychic aspect or consciousness to all reality. In a similar vein, he proposed that evolution had not ceased with the emergence of man, but was continuing to take place on the human level (in the noosphere) in the direction of a supreme consciousness. Humanity by reflectively coiling in upon itself was moving toward a point of future convergence, called the Omega point.

On a more philosophical level, Teilhard went on to lay down certain characteristics that such a point of convergence would have to have. Since evolution henceforth was to be carried on by man, further development could only take place in a way which would not violate human freedom. Love was seen to be the only force that was capable of bringing about unity among men and at the same time preserving the personal aspect of man. Accordingly, there must stand at the heart of things, at the point of future convergence, some personal being.

Teilhard was conscious of the weakness of his construction on the philosophical plane. He saw that it was only by introducing the certitude of Revelation that modern man could be given a guarantee sufficient to forestall his anxiety. Teilhard therefore attempted to see the Mystery of Christ, the Incarnation, in the new way, i.e., in the context of a world undergoing "genèse."

With respect to the Incarnation, Fr. Mooney stresses that Teilhard is at all times speaking of the real Body-Presence of Jesus of Nazareth in his resurrected and glorified form. Teilhard sees Christ's body in this sense as constituting a personal center for mankind and all material creation. He then goes on to affirm that Christ functions precisely as a "physical" center with respect to created reality. Teilhard, although always insistent on the need for the term "physical," was never fully able to give it a positive content. In using it he seems to be reacting against a theology which considered Christ's power over creation in a purely juridical, extrinsic way.

Teilhard drew his Christology from the canonical writings of Paul and John and also from the Greek Fathers. Fr. Mooney restricts his attention to the Pauline texts. He points out that Teilhard makes use of an aspect of Paul's thought pretty much neglected since the Greek Fathers. Teilhard was trying to show that Paul had spoken of a "physical" relationship between Christ and mankind and that he had extended this relationship so as to include the whole of creation. Father Mooney points out that in respect to both these points present-day Scripture scholars are inclined to agree with Teilhard.

Teilhard's treatment of evil and redemption constitutes a second major area of his theology. He distinguishes three forms of evil: the evil of growth, the evil of failure and disorder, and the evil of death. All three forms are present of necessity in a system undergoing evolution. Evil is something statistically inevitable. Moreover, the evil of death is a threshold by which man crosses to a new and higher mode of being. Teilhard strongly felt that Christian resignation was frequently a source of scandal to the modern world. The Christian's resignation must not keep him from striving with all his strength to dominate the evil he encounters.

In regard to the Redemption, Teilhard is guilty of a serious theological lapse, in that he fails to include in his system the negative aspect of redemption, reparation for man's sin. His failure here is partly due to his conceiving evil in too impersonal a way, as well as to his fear of neglecting the cosmic aspect of redemption. Moral evil, Teilhard admits, is able to have great effect on the physical order, for refusal to love is the one condition which is able to block the upward movement of mankind.

Another area of importance in Teilhard's theology is that of the Church and the Parousia. Over the course of time Teilhard elaborated a concept of the Church as a "phylum of love" divinely inserted into the evolutionary process. The Church is therefore the true source of love energy bringing about the upward movement of human life. Cosmogogenesis and Christogenesis are thus seen as one and the same reality. Christian activity must be a synthesis of man's two basic thrusts: the "Upward," directed toward God, and the "Forward," directed to the advancement of the world.

Christogenesis should be seen, though, not just as an accomplishment of man's freedom, but as a work of divine love and omnipotence as well. Teilhard thus is led to speak of God's continuous creation. He regards the three principal mysteries, Creation, Incarnation and Redemption as a single evolutionary movement reaching toward the final Pleroma of Christ. God will in some way complete himself, he asserts, in and through the Pleroma.

Teilhard speaks of the planetary maturation of mankind as being physically necessary but not sufficient with respect to the coming of the Parousia. That is to say, the Parousia, while a free intervention of God, involves man's cooperation in bringing the evolutionary movement to its full term. Man will then pass over a second threshold of reflection. There will be in some sense an end to the material world as we know it. Teilhard uses the terms "death," "reversal," "excentration" in this connection. After this there will be the Pleroma: God plus the world.

Father Mooney's book is both a job well done and a valuable contribution to current theological literature. He has succeeded in bringing together elements taken from the entire corpus of Teilhard's writings, giving to them both unity and a more conceptualized form and evaluating them from the standpoint of Christian faith and theology. The thought of Teilhard de Chardin, rich in vision and insight, is rightly regarded with esteem and interest by our contemporaries. Fr. Mooney's work affords an excellent means for becoming acquainted with Teilhard's ideas.

Jerome Farley, O.P.

SIGNS AND WONDERS. By Louis Monden, S.J. New York, Desclee, 1966. pp. 368. \$7.50.

"Jesus therefore said to them: Unless you see *signs and wonders* you do not believe." John 4:48.

Louis Monden, S.J., whose earlier available work *Sin, Liberty and Law* is still stirring moral theology, has finally seen his book *Signs and Wonders* appear in English. Originally, it was published in 1958 under the title *Het Wonder*; the French edition from which the English translation was made followed two years

later. The question is what took so long for so useful a book to be made available to the English-speaking world.

Father Monden's intent is to discuss the miraculous element in Christianity, and, contrary to expectations, he accomplishes this task with a minimum of polemics. The book is divided into two parts: "Theology of the Miraculous" and "Apologetics of the Miraculous." The first chapter considers the relationship of the miracle to the data of faith. Vatican I's teaching on the miraculous is delineated, and within this context the author sets his course for what is to follow. A dichotomy of emphasis has arisen between the miracle as a "divine fact" and the miracle as "sign of God's revelation." Without condoning any division between the two, Father Monden certainly does stress the latter, whereas past polemicism has taken its stand on the former. He bases his inquiry on the philosophy and theology of the "sign." As Avery Dulles has put it: "It is not necessary for me to defend this approach; Monden is his own best advocate." (p. viii) Subsequent chapters clarify the structure of the miraculous, the peculiarity of the Christian miracle, its dialogue with the growth of faith, and the miracle's devotional impetus.

The third chapter provides the reader with a quick perusal of the history of the miraculous in theology. This section is heavily footnoted; a working bibliography is likewise provided. (Throughout the book these aids prove to be outstanding assets.) But here the author's treatment of St. Thomas appears rather harsh. Aquinas has presented the miracle as surpassing the power of the created order; through reflection man attributes such a prodigy to God. The sign aspect never occurs in Thomas' definition (ST I, q. 110, a. 4, in c.). Monden says: "The biblical conception—an intervention which God himself intends to be significant—is practically abandoned." While granting that it does not appear in Thomas' definition, it does not exclude its appearing elsewhere at least implicitly. (In any case this is a disputed point, cf., the review of the French edition *Le Miracle, signe de salut* pp. 101-104 *Revue Thomiste*, vol. 63, 1963.) Nor does it seem fair to imply that Thomas is the father of the "debased conception" of the miracle that was to dominate theology up until the twentieth century. A fuller development of St. Thomas' use of the miracle would challenge the validity of this charge.

The sixth chapter, "Jesus the Wonder-Worker," begins with an apology for being located where it is in the order of sequence. This is necessary, Father Monden maintains, for the sake of a "logical plan." What this plan is is not all that clear. If, as he rightly maintains, "the theology of the miraculous must constantly return to its genuine springs," then it would seem more logical to start with the "spring" rather than to put it next to last. In the long run, however, this does not disturb the flow of thought.

In the second part of the book, Father Monden shows himself a master apologete. Passing from miracles as they are seen through the eyes of the believer (Part I), he now focuses his attention on the following question: "Do miracles really occur, and can we recognize them as divine signs with certainty?" The conclusion, given the occurrence of miracles within the Catholic Church, will be that "the Catholic Church may and should be accepted as the one true religion signified by God through these events."

The first chapter is probably the most crucial of this part of the book, at least for the non-believer. It is here that Father Monden unfolds what type of miracle is specifically apologetic; he follows this up with an analysis of possible prejudices on the part of the man who is to make a judgment on the miraculous. What is immediately striking is Monden's sense of fair play. This should serve to evoke in the reader an obligation of impartial reflection while reading what is yet to come. Chapters two and three show that the Catholic Church has what the author calls the "practical monopoly on what we have called 'major miracle'." The chapter entitled "Discernment of Miracles" points out that the facts just explained cannot be anything but "divine signs." This conclusion is reached after the author has analyzed the various hypotheses to the contrary. Towards the end of the chapter he shifts the apologetic from the scientific to the human plane. Man alone is able to discern the facts which even science itself bears witness to as being "miraculous." All that remains is man's free choice. Either the miracle is or is not a sign that is divine.

Father Monden shows, moreover, the invaluable service that modern science has rendered in establishing the authenticity of the miracle. The major miracles that he has chosen for his apologetic are recent ones—the Lourdes miracles. This he has done because of the medical and scientific scrutiny which has surrounded them since their inception a century ago. Again, the author has extensively and accurately documented the numerous cases discussed, all in readable though technical terminology.

Throughout the book the author unwittingly reveals himself as a man who witnesses to what he writes. Indeed, *Signs and Wonders* is an all-pervasive accolade of reverence for a hidden God who eternally coaxes mankind to "Come, think of Yahweh's marvels, the astounding things he has done in the world." *Psalms* 46, v. 8.

Alan Milmore, O.P.

MOUCHETTE. By Georges Bernanos. Translated from the French. Holt, Rinehart and Winston, Inc., 1966. pp. 127. \$3.95.

THE NEW PRIESTS. By Michel de Saint Pierre. Translated from the French. St. Louis, B. Herder, 1966. pp. 209. \$1.95.

These two new novels from France both deal with the poor, the present-day *anawim*, but from different points of view. The contrast between the two is instructive.

Bernanos' short masterpiece has been called "a compassionate memorial to human loneliness." It tells the delicate, lyrical but tragic story of a peasant girl who drowns herself in despair. Yet somehow, Bernanos manages to wring from the story a shining affirmation of a world that has been redeemed—a redemption even more vivid precisely because he sees it in the lowest of creatures.

Michel de Saint Pierre, on the other hand, treats the poor from the standpoint of those who must minister to them, the so-called "new priests." Some of these men have given up in the face of overwhelming odds, others have fallen into the hands of the Communists, and Father Paul Delance (the hero of the novel)

manages to be the most effective minister to the poor simply because he remains true to his priesthood and the virtue of obedience within it. Delance becomes a holy man, and the witness of his holiness far outstrips the misguided attempts of his fellow-curates.

While de Saint Pierre approaches his subject on a wider scale, Bernanos is content to quietly plumb the depths of the heart of one poor girl. Yet from these different avenues of approach, both authors emerge with basically the same ringing affirmation: that Jesus is in his poor, and that He must find Himself in them always. Both books should be read.

Joachim Plummer, O.P.

ST. MARTIN DE PORRES. By Sister Mary Alphonsus, O.S.S.R. New York, St. Martin De Porres Guild, 1966. pp. 204. \$3.95.

Father Norbert Georges, O.P., who has been the National Director of the St. Martin Guild in the United States for the past thirty years and who undoubtedly is one of the world's most well-informed admirers of St. Martin, highly recommends this book of Sister Mary Alphonsus for its accurate transmission of the events in the life of St. Martin. The fact that the style of the book is that of a novel may lead one to believe falsely that it lacks a scholarly basis. On the contrary, the lengthy bibliography found at the end witnesses to the historical precision with which the book was written. This bibliography includes not only the process of beatification of St. Martin but even a microfilm of the 17th century processes of beatification and canonization of St. Rose of Lima, a contemporary and close friend of St. Martin.

The portrait of St. Martin which Sister Mary Alphonsus presents is that of a person who still lives among us. The drama of a novel also gives us the spirit of St. Martin's family—his mother, father, sister and niece—who are almost unknown to the world. So little has been written of St. Martin that this book will be greatly sought for by all of his followers.

Christopher Allegra, O.P.

THE NATURE OF MYSTICISM. By David Knowles. Volume 38 of the TWENTIETH CENTURY ENCYCLOPEDIA OF CATHOLICISM. New York, Hawthorn Books, 1966. pp. 140. \$3.50.

So many sincere Christians are puzzled by the language of mystical theology. Who is not baffled to hear about the reception of *incommunicable* knowledge, to cite but one example? We might wonder what is involved in contemplation that makes it differ from meditation, or we might question the significance of "giving to others the fruits of contemplation" if inexpressible knowledge is the content. What is the difference between being mystic, contemplative, ecstatic, or merely meditative? There has been a steady growth of this language throughout the ages of Christianity, and much of it is very technical, with different meanings according to different schools of thought. To compound the difficulty many of these words cannot be given patristic or biblical sources.

In order to appreciate the true meaning of mystical terms and their relevance to Christian practices, David Knowles examines them in relation to the sources of our faith and outlines the historical context of their development and usage. He further distinguishes profane from religious usage without, however, ignoring the valuable insights these natural meanings provide.

The genuine efforts at spiritual renewal within the Church today strive both to preserve what is best in traditional teaching and practice and to adapt to new requirements. Love of Christ and the thirst for more intimate knowledge of Him will always be the main objective of our religious efforts. The mystical life stands as a supreme achievement of man's cooperation with the divine, and Professor Knowles should contribute to the progress of many souls with this study.

Bernard Dupont, O.P.

THE NEW THEOLOGIAN. By Ved Mehta. New York, Evanston, and London, Harper and Row, 1966. pp. 209. \$5.95.

The New Theologian is a journalist's investigation of contemporary theology. Mr. Mehta treats his subject from three angles—American, British and German—which correspond to the three chapters of his book.

A Dramatic Story of
ST. MARTIN DE PORRES

by Sister Mary Alphonsus, O.S.S.R.

**A Challenge to People of All Races
and Stations in Life**

Place your order now . . .

208 Pages - Price \$3.95 - Postage Paid

Inspiring - Ennobling

THE SAINT MARTIN DE PORRES GUILD

160 Fifth Avenue, Room 719

• New York, N. Y. 10010

In each chapter Mr. Mehta gives a short introduction to the theological situation of the country. He then records his interviews in a water color sketch of each theologian, with a general view of his key ideas. The book begins in America and focuses on the "death of God" controversy. Here we meet such men as Niebuhr, Tillich and Hamilton and get a quick glimpse at their insights. Next Mr. Mehta crosses the ocean to England where he shows through the eyes of Vidler, Williams, MacKinnon, Robinson, Archbishop Ramsey, Stacey and Ian Ramsey that the church in that country has apparently failed. Finally Mr. Mehta moves to Germany and introduces Barth, Bultman and Bonhoeffer. The bulk of this last chapter is a history of Bonhoeffer's life and thought as seen by his relatives and friends.

This book can be both enjoyable to professionals and useful to non-professional theologians who want a general view of present day theology. However Mr. Mehta should have entitled his book *The New Protestant Theologian* because the only Catholics mentioned are Aquinas and Pope John XXIII, who come up in two side comments. Nevertheless, the book is a fine piece of journalism.

Antoninus Dempsey, O.P.

CHASTITY AND THE AFFECTIVE LIFE. By Albert Plé, O.P.
New York, Herder and Herder, 1966. pp. 192. \$4.95.

For too long Catholics have been raised on a morality which reduces the Gospel to a set of rules to be obeyed.

The whole problem is that law be *truly in the service of love*. Or to speak the language of the psycho-analysts, the issue is for the "super-ego," which is necessary for the psychological growth of the child, to be balanced and little by little assumed by the dynamism of a conscious, oblatory, and free love. (p. 18.)

To take the place of a law morality, Father Plé urges a return to the older virtue morality of St. Thomas Aquinas, complemented by the insights of Freud and modern psychology.

In the first chapter Father Plé analyzes the nature of the truly human act, self-determined by intellect and will. But in fact much human activity does not measure up to the criteria for a free act; such activity is sub-human, or pre-human (normal for children but often carried over into later life). It is in this pre-human area that Freud has so much to offer the moralist. By correlating the insights of Freud and St. Thomas, Plé indicates how the personality becomes integrated both by psychological maturation and by the infusion of charity. In chapter two, the author takes issue with a morality of duty, which induces people to measure the goodness of an action by the amount of effort it takes. Aquinas, following Aristotle, made pleasure an essential element in happiness without making it an end in itself.

Chastity becomes the focus of attention in the second half of the book. Plé applies his general principles to an analysis of chastity; he emphasizes that continence, the sense of modesty and the sense of honor are not true virtues even

though they are necessary stages in the development of chastity; he points out how interconnected the virtues are: "one grows in virtue only by growing in all at the same time." (p. 162) When it comes to the question of religious chastity, his remarks are brief but often striking: he calls for psychological testing of candidates and psychological training for novice and student masters. A final chapter on charity refocuses the entire work.

An air of controversy pervades the book. Plé responds to the psychoanalysts' suspicion that Christian morality is only super-ego, but he is just as quick to learn what he can from the psychoanalysts. With his co-religionists he is anxious to reinstate Thomistic attitudes in morals. Challenges of this sort give the book its relevance but, at the same time, render it difficult for the untrained reader. Plé's language is often technical, presupposing an undergraduate's acquaintance with psychology. He frequently feels constrained to retain Latin terminology and tends to get overly concise; perhaps he is trying to cover too much ground in one thin volume. Nevertheless, the author is capable of a happy turn of phrase—virtues are "dynamisms," a spiritual "musculature"—and writes with admirable style in many passages.

The title and the dust jacket can lead the reader to expect more on problems of religious chastity. The author in fact, gives only a few guide lines. Scripture is certainly quoted but is not the immediate basis for the author's themes and contemporary Church teaching gets scant mention. (This is because Aquinas and Freud are the author's principle sources.) Nevertheless, *Chastity and the Affective Life* does show the natural basis without which the supernatural order cannot be understood and indicates how grace perfects man's sexual nature.

Father Plé has provided us with a thought-provoking analysis of man's affections. Those responsible for the formation of religious or anyone interested in a careful study on chastity will find his work of great value.

Matthew Rzczkowski, O.P.

"LAW AND POLITICAL THEORY," Vol. XXVIII of the **SUMMA THEOLOGIAE** of St. Thomas Aquinas (I-II, 90-97). By **Thomas Gilby, O.P.** New York, McGraw-Hill, 1966. pp. 205 + xxv. \$7.00.

Today, moral questions present much of the matter for theological discussions. For these discussions to be true to the nature and purpose of theological investigation, however, they cannot be centered upon conclusions and subtle distinctions arrived at by the use of reason alone. Theology is a human action which follows the act of faith man renders to God who has revealed himself. It is the human mind searching to understand (under the illumination of faith) what God has revealed and what the Church has transmitted of that revelation to a particular age. For this reason, the sources of Christian theology, as well as the thought of the authors of its major currents, must be made as widely available as possible. The English translation of the *Summa* on "Law and Political Theory" by Fr. Thomas Gilby, O.P. is a step towards filling that need.

This volume of the English *Summa* is certainly a useful reference for the study of theology today. What is offered here is not just a precise and readable translation. Fr. Gilby has presented an historical analysis of the questions of legal and political theory. Through this analysis we see the way in which a theory of law and politics grew out of a tangle of Roman law, both civil and canonical, Lombard law, the common laws, laws arising from custom, the Mosaic legislation of the Pentateuch and the miscellaneous statutes of kingdoms and cities. It was the task of St. Thomas to formulate a theory of law which would be free from this mass of detailed legislation and from the influence of Augustinianism which emphasized the minatory or coercive role of law.

The achievement of Thomas Aquinas is that he was able to envision his theory of law within the context of the Gospel law of grace. His theology of law is not a *Tractatus de Praeceptis et Peccatis*, because law for St. Thomas is not a remedy *propter peccatum*. Law does not exist solely to execute punishment for the offenses committed against a community. Primarily, it is a directive power, regulating and ordering man's actions in the pursuit of virtue. The coercive or punitive role of law is a secondary function and one not called for if man is lawful.

The great contribution of St. Thomas Aquinas is that he writes as a philosopher and as a theologian working from Revelation and Tradition. He prefers to settle an issue by an appeal to the "reasonableness" of the Christian precepts rather than to "constitutional technicalities or to an allegedly historical hypothesis." (p. xxv.) He is thus able to avoid a juridical style and so stand apart from any political or legal bias of his time.

Following the English translation of the text, Fr. Gilby offers a series of appendices. Their purpose is to present guidelines for thought in various areas of law and politics. Among topics included in the appendices are "Law and Dominion in Theology," "The Natural Law," "Common and Public Good," "Legal Sovereignty" and "Coercion and Law." It is in these appendices that the reader will see Father Gilby drawing on a vast knowledge of history and legal and political philosophy.

This volume concludes with a glossary of some common terms which either appear in the text or arise in the discussion. Rarer terms are defined as they appear in the text.

This translation of the treatise of St. Thomas on "Law and Political Theory" should prove a valuable asset for the libraries of theologians and theological students.

Vincent F. Gere, O.P.

THE HEART OF THOMAS MORE. Selected Readings for Every Day. Arranged by E. E. Reynolds. Springfield, Ill., Templegate, 1966. pp. 176. \$3.95.

As with their earlier volume on Thérèse of Lisieux, Templegate has furnished us with a day-to-day book of meditations drawn from the writings of a great saint of the Church. In this case, Thomas More emerges with all his well-known hardheadedness, common sense, realism and fondness for "the thickets of the

law," that have made him the champion of Catholic laymen and lawyers since Newman's day at least. Besides this, however, the selections chosen give us a lesser-known insight into the heart of the saint, namely, his tender filial piety, devotion to the Blessed Sacrament, and sense of man's complete dependence on the grace of God. Only gently suggested in Bolt's *Man for All Seasons*, More's deep spirituality is in sharp focus here, providing ample evidence for both his sainthood and popularity. A marvelous book of short meditations for laymen and religious as well.

Joachim Plummer, O.P.

The following review of a book by our own Father Burke first appeared in the Winter, 1967 issue of Salesian Studies. Its author is a layman, and we felt its analysis is more objective than a review by one of our staff members could be. We are grateful to Salesian Studies for permission to reprint the review here.

THE SUNDAY HOMILY. Edited by John Burke, O.P. Washington, The Thomist Press, 1966. pp. 141. \$2.75. Paper.

This is one of those unusual books on preaching that contains knowledge which can be put to work anytime in improving homilies. It is a book, too, whose instructions and recommendations are based on the reality of much contemporary preaching rather than on books on preaching. It consists of various papers delivered at the 1965 Workshop on the Renewal in Scriptural and Liturgical Preaching, which was conducted under the Speech and Drama and Sacred Theology departments of the Catholic University of America, and aimed at helping a number of parish priests preach their homilies in the spirit of renewal now blowing through the open Church. The papers were lectures delivered in background lecture-discussion periods on liturgy and scripture prior to and as preparation for small group sessions in the writing and delivery of homilies. These small sessions were guided by professional teachers of speech and homiletics acting as *rapporteurs*, whose reactions and reports constitute the second half of the book.

The papers can be divided, according to classical Aristotelian rhetoric, into talks on the speaker or preacher himself; the speaker's message; the audience to whom the message is directed; and the means by which the message is communicated. One of the unfortunate aspects of this generally fine book is that preaching is considered almost exclusively as an act of communication, rather than also as an act of expression, which communication necessarily presupposes, and which, therefore, is primary in the act of preaching.

Indeed, the first paper by William H. Graham is called "The Theory of Communication." After making a number of excellent points on misconceptions that impede the development of the priest as an instrument of communication, on their bad preaching habits, on the unity of body and soul in the preacher, on good and effective visual and word habits for preaching, and on ear training, Graham rightly emphasizes the dire need of preachers to possess, above all, the fire of love, which before it is a fire of communication must be a blaze of expression.

Richard Hanley, O.M.I., then provides the reader with an overly documented but thorough exposition of "The Theology of Preaching." He seems to favor a rather juridical interpretation of the mission to preach, which is not necessarily, though he thinks so, "founded on the traditional interpretation of Paul's rhetorical question to the Romans" (Rom 10:14-15). One would like, too, to see more emphasis and light thrown on the proclamatory and exhortable nature of preaching rather than on its minor explanatory aspects.

On the preacher's message itself, the best of four papers are those of Alan Smith, O.P., on "Preaching Salvation History," and especially the brilliantly written and thought out but truncated treatment of "The People of God" as a theme for preaching by Geoffrey Wood, S.A. The other two articles on "The Liturgical Relations of the Homily" and "The Sacred Scriptures and Preaching" make good points along somewhat conventional and repetitious structures. Both, of course, treat topics quite relevant to preaching homilies and make the book's treatment of the preacher's message a comprehensive one.

On the audience to which the homily is directed, the book, like many homilies themselves, unfortunately has not said enough, nor has it penetrated this aspect of preaching. A rather remote paper by Robert Paul Mohan, S.S., sketches the history of naturalism in American thought for the reader, with the point being that it influences the people of God to whom the homilies are directed and, therefore, should be considered by the preacher. Mohan feels, however, that religious sociologists like Fathers Fichter, Thomas, and Greeley must spell out the sociological minutiae of the problems caused by naturalism. Msgr. John C. Knott, thank God, gets down to the "minutiae," in "Modern Influences on Family Life," but tends to get lost in the needs of people to be loved and to love without relating them sufficiently to preaching. He makes important and valid observations on the people to whom the preacher will preach, but it is only a few of the people he considers and only one general point he makes. These two papers are far from an adequate, and indeed are almost a vacuous, consideration of the raw needs of the audience to which the homily is directed, which, in this reviewer's opinion, is the major defect of almost all present day homilies and books on preaching. Moreover, only in one article in the whole book is a distinction made between preaching to believers and preaching to non-believers. Whatever happened, too, to preaching in the streets and in byways?

Leo Brady, then, in the last paper, "Creative Writing for the Preacher," treats along with Graham the means by which the preacher's message is expressed and communicated. He makes several practical points on writing a sermon, preparing it for delivery, and the use of relevant vocabulary. It is debatable, however, whether or not the preacher is capable of becoming a fine artist in the same way that Stravinsky, O'Connor, and Eliot are fine artists. But certainly the cry for imagination in preaching is always needed.

In general, the papers in this book do not pay enough attention to the visual elements in good preaching, which their authors surely know are valuable aids in perfecting the act of preaching.

Finally, the second part of the book reveals the reports of the *rapporteurs*, mentioned above. In the first, Charlotte E. Lee is understanding and perceptive in pointing out the problems, like the lack of vocal and physical technique, of

the priest participants. In the second, T. J. Spencer treats deftly of "clerical tone" in preaching, but seems to confuse the abuses of such devices as storytelling, examples, and extended metaphors with their valid and necessary uses. He rightly points out, however, that the positive correction for the abuses of such rhetorical devices is for the preacher "to focus sharply on the real needs, the real character, the real world of the congregation" (p. 133). In the third report, Eugene L. Walle relates a battery of significant statistics on the various speech, hearing, and voice defects of each priest examined, and offers both immediate and long range recommendations for eliminating or mitigating the difficulties.

All things considered, the book, despite the stated reservations, should be must reading for every bishop, priest, and layman in the Church. For the Lord knows how deep the wounds are that all the People of God suffer because of so many sophomoric and sterile sermons.

Kenneth L. Evans

PREACHING AS A SAVING ENCOUNTER. By Michael Schmaus. Translated by J. Holland Smith. Staten Island, Alba House, 1966. pp. 136. \$3.50.

In *Preaching As a Saving Encounter* Michael Schmaus demonstrates how we meet Jesus Christ as the Word of God in the mouth of men. Preaching the Word of God also involves preaching those doctrines which the church has proclaimed to be a part of the revelation of the Word of God. For this reason the author lays heavy emphasis on the role of doctrine in preaching the faith. Msgr. Schmaus also considers the relationship between the preaching church and the listening church and, finally, discusses the absolute character of the church's preaching.

Regarding doctrinal preaching, the author shows how the unchangeable element in the church's doctrine is inseparably linked with the changeable. For the word of God is delivered to men in a particular historical setting and cannot be extricated from this setting. What endures as the permanent reality behind the church's preaching is the word of God uttered by men and inviting men to a saving encounter with Jesus Christ. To preach the word is to carry Christ's message, that is, to carry Christ himself to men and to lead men back to Christ. The cycle is complete when those who hear the word of God and receive it into their hearts turn toward Christ in the total submission of faith.

Encounter with Christ takes place in the Church's preaching because Jesus Christ is communicated in that preaching. In other words Jesus Christ saves through preaching. This is not to say that Christ's power to save comes only through preaching; rather preaching is still another medium for Christ to come as "bringer of salvation."

Schmaus examines the relationship between doctrine and preaching in the light of two distinct schools of thought. One school would prefer to see preaching as a defense of doctrine and truths, a safeguard against error. The other would view preaching as more orientated to communication of truth for the sake of human beings; the proponents of this latter view would not be afraid to sacrifice the technical language of theology for the sake of human beings in need of

salvation. In fact both points of view complement each other and form a balanced theology of preaching.

While the Church proclaims Jesus Christ as the Redeemer and calls for a leap of faith, she presents the content of revelation as a sequel to this act of faith in the person of Christ and seeks assent to the truths of the faith. But one can have a knowledge of Christian doctrine without true Christian faith. Here we can call upon the social awareness of the Church and her preachers to present the challenge of revelation in a contemporary mode of expression.

In the second part of the book the author discusses those who proclaim and those who listen. The whole Church is both preacher and listener. Every Christian has a commission to preach by reason of his Baptism. If he is a layman, he must influence his social environment, be it his family or professional acquaintances. And they in turn should do likewise. But the task of preaching is committed in a special and unmistakable way to the hierarchy, who are entrusted with the church's doctrinal function.

The scope of those to whom the word of God is addressed includes (in addition to Catholics) all Christians, non-Christians, and those in the modern secularized world. Although it is true that all non-Christians can encounter God, a new kind of encounter is offered in Christianity, one which comes through preaching.

Finally, Schmaus shows that preaching has an absolute character in its concern for universal salvation. The value of preaching lies in its offering of a goal and a way, of a relationship with God and with love itself. Christ is absolute insofar as everything relating to salvation depends on him, and insofar as all creation is being reformed according to the pattern of his resurrection. Thus preaching is concerned with the route that the church follows as an eschatological pilgrim community.

The scope of this book is staggering. One would expect a hasty and superficial consideration of the topics mentioned. But Schmaus, in his professional competence as one of Europe's foremost theologians, has given us a brief but accurate study of the Church's function as preacher and teacher of the word of God.

Luke Prest, O.P.